

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/325491711>

# Translanguaging with multilingual students: Learning from classroom moments , García, O., & Kleyn, T. (Eds.): New York, NY: Routledge, 236 pp.

Article in *Bilingual Research Journal* · May 2018

DOI: 10.1080/15235882.2018.1468365

---

CITATIONS

0

READS

623

1 author:



Caitlin G Fine

University of Colorado Boulder

6 PUBLICATIONS 1 CITATION

[SEE PROFILE](#)



# Bilingual Research Journal

The Journal of the National Association for Bilingual Education

ISSN: 1523-5882 (Print) 1523-5890 (Online) Journal homepage: <http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/ubrij20>

## Translanguaging with multilingual students: Learning from classroom moments, García, O., & Kleyn, T. (Eds.)

Caitlin G. Fine

To cite this article: Caitlin G. Fine (2018): Translanguaging with multilingual students: Learning from classroom moments, García, O., & Kleyn, T. (Eds.), Bilingual Research Journal, DOI: [10.1080/15235882.2018.1468365](https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2018.1468365)

To link to this article: <https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2018.1468365>



Published online: 31 May 2018.



Submit your article to this journal [↗](#)



View related articles [↗](#)



View Crossmark data [↗](#)

## BOOK REVIEW

García, O., & Kleyn, T. (Eds.) (2016). *Translanguaging with Multilingual Students: Learning from Classroom Moments*. New York, NY: Routledge, 236 pp.

This edited book is a welcome addition to the literature on translanguaging pedagogy. The content is drawn from ongoing *transformative action research* that has grown out of a research-practice partnership between the City University of New York and New York public schools, known as the City University of New York–New York State Initiative on Emergent Bilinguals (CUNY-NYSIEB). While the first two chapters provide the theoretical base about translanguaging and specifics about the CUNY-NYSIEB project, the heart of this text is comprised of six case studies, coauthored by public school teachers and researchers, detailing how translanguaging is taken up in lesson designs as a pedagogical orientation and highlighting ways in which translanguaging already happens organically in classrooms in the teachers' and students' spontaneous moves. The last two chapters effectively accomplish two goals: (a) address the ways in which translanguaging education policy disrupts traditional ways of thinking about language policies in K–12 classrooms, and (b) outline implications for teachers and teacher educators. Although this text is grounded in the U.S. education context, specifically schools in New York State, the authors stress that the work they describe is important and relevant to educators worldwide.

This textual resource begins with background information about the history and context surrounding the term *translanguaging* and operationalizes the theory of translanguaging taken up throughout the entire CUNY-NYSIEB project. Credit for the term has been largely attributed to Williams's (1996) description of pedagogical practices observed in Welsh classrooms where students used multiple linguistic repertoires to process and demonstrate learning. However, the theoretical and linguistic base for the use of the term among bilingual communities has been expanded and deepened by a growing community of scholars in recent years (Flores & Rosa, 2015; García, 2009; García & Leiva, 2014; García & Wei, 2014; Hornberger & Link, 2012; Otheguy, García, & Reid, 2015; Sánchez, García, & Solorza, 2017). In line with recent scholarship, García and Kleyn explain, "Translanguaging refers to the deployment of a speaker's full linguistic repertoire, which does not in any way correspond to the socially and politically defined boundaries of named languages" (p. 14). They identify that bilinguals have one language system and that the features of that system belong to the bilingual person—not to the languages themselves. Thus, the important work of teachers who take up translanguaging pedagogies is to "start from a place that leverages all the features of the children's repertoire, while also showing them when, with whom, where, and why to use some features of their repertoire and not others, enabling them to also perform according to the social norms of named languages as used in school" (p. 15).

The second part of the first chapter describes the specific elements of the authors' translanguaging pedagogical practice (stance, design, shifts, and assessment). García and Kleyn identify a translanguaging stance as an ideology that understands language as a child-centered resource capable of transforming language hierarchies in schools and restoring the power of language to communities and to bilingual students themselves. García and Kleyn identify translanguaging design as involving collaborative structures, varied multilingual and multimodal instructional resources, and translanguaging pedagogical practices that enable students to engage in sense-making and to "show and build their linguistic virtuosity" (p. 23). Translanguaging shifts require that teachers be responsive to individual students' linguistic repertoires and shift instruction as necessary. Finally, teachers who take up translanguaging pedagogy design formative and summative assessments that provide

space for students to demonstrate their learning through their entire linguistic repertoire. This pedagogy is explained in more detail in a second and related book, *The Translanguaging Classroom* (García, Johnson, & Seltzer, 2017).

Chapters 3 through 8 are powerful in that they focus on specific case studies and provide administrators, in-service teachers, teacher educators, and preservice teachers concrete examples of what translanguaging pedagogy looks like in a variety of different classroom contexts. For example, individual chapters focus on content areas such as English language arts, social studies, and science. Chapters span multiple grade levels (K–5, middle school, high school) and language programs (transitional bilingual, dual language, students with interrupted schooling, multilingual students in English-only classrooms). CUNY-NYSIEB researchers are the primary authors of these chapters, but teacher-collaborators are listed as coauthors, and it is clear throughout the case study chapters that classroom teachers provided significant input. All case study chapters follow a similar format and highlight the importance of understanding the local community, school, classroom, and student context when designing translanguaging lessons. Each chapter describes background for the 45-minute/1-hour lesson and the process by which the researcher and teacher collaborated to jointly plan for translanguaging within the lesson. Chapters conclude with implications, discussion questions, references, and activities building off of the chapter content that could be used in in-service or preservice professional development. One of the main strengths of these case study chapters is the inclusion of a separate section entitled “Teacher’s Voice” where the collaborative teachers describe the process and reflect upon the impact of strategically planning for translanguaging within their classroom.

The final two chapters uncover tensions between subtractive, structuralist language policies and the critical poststructuralist position of translanguaging theory. Subtractive, structuralist language policies are typical in U.S. schools where normative ideologies push for English-only education for bilingual students. Critical poststructuralist language policies center translanguaging as the linguistic reality and norm of bilingual students. These poststructuralist policies critique and transcend established structuralist policies, ultimately promoting social justice for bilingual students, their families, and their communities. García and Kleyn outline 10 ways in which translanguaging theory disrupts traditional ways of thinking about language policies. For example, they suggest that translanguaging theory (a) disrupts monolingualism and the way bilingualism is traditionally conceptualized (through a monolingual lens); (b) disrupts the distance between home and school; and (c) disrupts inequities, hierarchies, and circles of power.

Finally, this textual resource offers implications for teachers and teacher educators. Implications for teachers are organized into lessons for all teachers, for bilingual teachers, for English-medium teachers, and for content-area teachers. The section on implications for teacher educators suggests the importance of starting with faculty, developing course content across different required courses that focus on emerging bilingual learners, and encouraging teacher candidates to plan for, experience, observe, and try out translanguaging as an overarching practice across their coursework. While the authors offer ideas of what these elements might look like, they do not detail how to work through the likely challenges involved with getting faculty to work in this way. This seems to be an area ripe for further research.

This resource embodies several important strengths that make it highly useful for teachers and teacher educators. First, the six case study chapters provide concrete examples so readers really have a sense of what translanguaging pedagogy looks like across grade levels, content areas, and language program types. The “Teacher’s Voice” sections at the end of each case study chapter provide practicing teachers and preservice teachers a quick teacher perspective devoid of abstract theory. Throughout the edited book, obvious effort has been made to connect theory to practice in an approachable, digestible manner. The idea of researchers and teachers coauthoring chapters is unique, and the resulting chapters work for a variety of readers and learners. The plethora of photos

of classroom contexts and student work samples incorporated throughout case study chapters bring to life the dynamic work that teachers and students are engaged in within the diverse classrooms. Finally, noncase study chapters present important theory in consumable ways and describe the methodology, partnership with schools, policy implications, and recommendations for teachers and teacher educators in a clear and organized manner.

While excellent, this textual resource has several gaps that could be improved upon through ongoing research by the CUNY-NYSIEB team or by the legions of young scholars who are eagerly following in their footsteps. First, the case studies mostly highlight English language arts lessons. The social studies and science examples are based on classroom lessons focused on reading about social studies or science but not engaging in group-based, inquiry projects or ambitious science teaching (Windschitl, Thompson, & Braaten, 2018). What does translanguaging pedagogy look like in a science class steeped in multimodal, Next Generation Science Standards-based three-dimensional learning (National Research Council, 2012) where students create mechanistic models of scientific phenomena and develop arguments from their own or classmates' evidence (rather than evidence they read about in a book)?

Second, the case studies included in this resource represent "best-case scenarios" that are the result of intensive long-term one-on-one researcher/teacher collaboration in schools that have also received a tremendous amount of researcher-led professional development and benefit from administrator support. Knowing what is possible in a best-case scenario is helpful, but teachers who read this resource on their own and want to take up translanguaging pedagogy might be curious, overwhelmed, or even frustrated as to how to go about doing it with little/no researcher support. Including some of the challenges, contradictions, and constraints the CUNY-NYSIEB teachers faced as they planned for and enacted translanguaging pedagogy in their classrooms could enrich and expand the impact of this important textual resource.

Third, the lesson-based examples do a wonderful job illustrating how students interact and learn in translanguaging spaces over the short term. As the field expands, it is important to also investigate longer-term outcomes for students who are fortunate to learn through translanguaging pedagogy. Finally, the case study chapters highlight the fruits of long-term collaborations between researchers and in-service teachers. How can university faculty be supported to transform preservice teacher education programs by weaving in translanguaging pedagogies, and how can preservice teachers be encouraged to take up translanguaging pedagogies and rehearse them out throughout their preservice coursework? Further research is needed to uncover what these processes look like and how to best plan for them in different teacher preparation contexts.

This edited volume is recommended for preservice and in-service teachers, teacher educators/researchers, and administrators. Preservice and in-service teachers would most benefit from the case study chapters on specific lessons, but chapter 1 and chapter 10 would also provide them with important theoretical background and recommendations. There is no reason to wait until teachers are in the classroom before pushing them to think about translanguaging as an ideological stance and as a pedagogical practice. Preservice teachers might benefit from reading and comparing/contrasting case studies from this resource with case studies of other contexts where teachers embody a more deficit perspective of students' languaging practices.

Teacher educators would most benefit from reading chapters 1, 2, and 10 to think through how to infuse teacher education programs with translanguaging ideology and pedagogy and how to organize meaningful university-school partnerships. The online resources may also provide inspiration and inspiration for teacher educators at the university level. Administrators and policy makers would most benefit from chapters 1 and 9 to get a sense of the theoretical framing and ideological shift required to understand translanguaging pedagogy as well as policy implications that could have a broad, lasting impact across multiple levels of the education sector. Overall, this is a highly important resource for those working with emergent bilingual students and their teachers.

Caitlin G. Fine

University of Colorado–Boulder

 [caitlin.fine@colorado.edu](mailto:caitlin.fine@colorado.edu)  <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-8605-7264>© 2018 the National Association for Bilingual Education  
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2018.1468365>

## References

- Flores, N., & Rosa, J. (2015). Undoing appropriateness: Raciolinguistic ideologies and language diversity in education. *Harvard Educational Review*, 85(2), 149–171. doi:10.17763/0017-8055.85.2.149
- García, O. (2009). *Bilingual education in the 21st century: A global perspective*. Oxford, UK: Wiley-Blackwell.
- García, O., Johnson, S. I., & Seltzer, K. (2017). *The translanguaging classroom: Leveraging student bilingualism for learning*. Philadelphia, PA: Caslon.
- García, O., & Leiva, C. (2014). Theorizing and enacting translanguaging for social justice. In A. Blackledge & A. Creese (Eds.), *Heteroglossia as practice and pedagogy* (pp. 199–218). Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer.
- García, O., & Wei, L. (2014). *Translanguaging: Language, bilingualism and education*. London, UK: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hornberger, N., & Link, H. (2012). Translanguaging and transnational literacies in multilingual classrooms: A biliteracy lens. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 15(3), 261–278. doi:10.1080/13670050.2012.658016
- National Research Council. (2012). *A framework for K–12 science education: Practices, crosscutting concepts, and core ideas*. Washington, DC: National Academies Press.
- Otheguy, R., García, O., & Reid, W. (2015). Clarifying translanguaging and deconstructing named languages: A perspective from linguistics. *Applied Linguistics Review*, 6(3), 281–307. doi:10.1515/applirev-2015-0014
- Sánchez, M. T., García, O., & Solorza, C. (2017). Reframing language allocation policy in dual language bilingual education. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 41(1), 37–51.
- Williams, C. (1996). Secondary education: Teaching in the bilingual situation. In C. Williams, G. Lewis, & C. Baker (Eds.), *The language policy: Taking stock* (pp. 39–78). Llangefni, UK: CAI.
- Windschitl, M., Thompson, J., & Braaten, M. (2018). *Ambitious science teaching*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard Education Press.